

## New Social Actors in Environment and Development

### Annotated Bibliography

Jennifer L. Johnson

#### I. NGOs and the Nation-State

Bebbington, Anthony and John Farrington. 1993. "Governments, NGOs and agricultural development: Perspectives on changing inter-organisational relationships." *The Journal of Development Studies* 29(2): 199-219.

General observations about NGO-government relations—the tensions they are likely to entail, the potential for more effective collaboration, etc.—based on findings of a multi-agency study coordinated by the Overseas Development Institute (ODI-UK).

Bebbington, Anthony and Graham Thiele. 1993. *Non-Governmental Organizations and the State in Latin America: Rethinking roles in sustainable agriculture*. London & New York: Routledge.

One of three continent-wide volumes summarizing results of the ODI study referenced in Bebbington and Farrington 1993. Examines cooperation between NGOs and national agricultural research and extension services (NARs) in Latin America drawing on case studies of NGOs, NARs and NGO coordinating bodies in Bolivia, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador and Peru. Overall optimistic assessment of potential for developing agricultural techniques appropriate for small-scale peasant farming through NGO-NAR coordination. As is common among recent studies of development NGOs (e.g., Carroll, 1992), case selection overrepresents strong, participatory organizations and thus calls into question efforts to extrapolate from results to broader "lessons learned."

Bosch, Margarita. 1997. "NGOs and development in Brazil: Roles and responsibilities in a 'New World Order.'" In David Hulme and Michael Edwards, eds. *NGOs, states and donors: Too close for comfort?* New York, NY: St. Martin's Press, pp. 232-42.

Brief commentary on efforts of Brazilian NGOs to pressure the government to guarantee constitutionally-backed political and socio-economic citizens rights. Describes the success of the Centro Dom Helder Câmara (CENDHEC) in assisting the poor in the northeastern city of Recife to reclaim their rights to basic health care and education.

Carroll, Thomas F. 1992. *Intermediary NGOs: The supporting link in grassroots development*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.

Inter-American Foundation (IAF) sponsored study of 30 Latin American NGOs (recipients of IAF funding) that link local beneficiaries and often remote government and donor institutions. Seeks to address international donor community's bias against these "intermediary" organizations by providing empirically-grounded, field-based analysis. Concise review of literature on NGOs and extremely rich case material from NGOs in Peru, Costa Rica and Chile. Major weakness is methodological: *a priori* selection of "good performers" from IAF's portfolio (i.e., poor performers excluded from the sample) limits validity of generalizations about intermediary NGOs as a whole.

Cesar Fernandes, Rubem and Leandro Piquet Carneiro. 1995. "Brazilian NGOs in the 1990s: A survey." In Charles A. Reilly, ed. *New paths to democratic development in Latin America: The rise of NGO-municipal collaboration*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., pp. 71-84.

Report results of a 1991 survey of NGO leaders conducted at the First National Assembly of Brazilian NGOs. Characterizes Brazilian NGOs as inspired by church and leftist political philosophies, apt to adopt an attitude of "impassioned pragmatism" *vis-à-vis* the state, and tightly linked to international donors. Useful, empirically-grounded sketch of NGOs in Brazil.

Clark, John. 1991. *Democratizing development: The role of voluntary organizations*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.

One of the first and most frequently cited books written by development practitioners in the 1990s on the positive contribution of NGOs to development and democratization. Urges NGOs to complement involvement in field-based projects with efforts at affecting policy reform. Good, if somewhat dated, overview of opportunities and dilemmas development NGOs confront in the era of structural adjustment.

Edwards, Michael and David Hulme, eds. 1996. *Beyond the magic bullet: NGO performance and accountability in the post-Cold War*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.

Second of three volumes resulting from workshops on "scaling up NGO impact" sponsored by Save the Children Fund-UK and the Institute for Development Policy and Management at Manchester University. Authors point to serious shortcomings of procedures currently employed by development NGOs to assess performance and accountability, and propose new concepts and methods for evaluation. Contains some useful didactic tools including a table that visually summarizes multiple actors to which Southern NGOs are accountable (page 10), and brief chapters on NGOs in Central and Latin America. However, discussion more germane for development practitioners than students of NGO-donor-state relations. Volume Three (Hulme and Edwards, 1997) treats this issue more directly and in greater depth.

Hernández, Luis and Jonathan Fox. 1995. "Mexico's difficult democracy: Grassroots movements, NGOs, and local government." In Charles A. Reilly, ed. *New paths to democratic development in Latin America: The rise of NGO-municipal collaboration*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., pp. 179-210.

Analysis of the role (largely marginal to date) that NGOs have played in democratizing local government in Mexico. Notes the "political underdevelopment of Mexican NGOs" relative to the active, progressive role of the NGO community in South American countries like Brazil and attributes this to the historically "omnipresent" Mexican state, lack of external funding from North America and Europe, and isolation from "the most cutting edge popular movements." Provides an excellent overview of Mexican civil society and a useful profile of national NGO community by sector (housing, women's development, environment, rural development and human rights).

Hulme, David and Michael Edwards, eds. 1997. *NGOs, states and donors: Too close for comfort?* New York, NY: St. Martin's Press.

Outlines framework for analyzing NGO relationships to private donors in developed countries and to developing and developed country states. Based on case studies from multiple regions (e.g., Asia, the Arab countries, Latin America), refutes the assertion that NGOs everywhere are rapidly being reduced to public sector contractors (Korten, 1990). Nonetheless, ties to grassroots constituencies have weakened considerably as NGOs conform to the financial and technical

requirements of private and multi-lateral patrons. Concludes that Northern and Southern NGOs alike must “return to their roots” in order to play effective role in poverty alleviation.

Meyer, Carrie A. 1995. “Opportunism and NGOs: Entrepreneurship and Green North-South transfers.” *World Development* 23(8): 1277-89.

Applies new institutional economics to interpret the burst of Southern NGO activity on the environment as a response by entrepreneurs to Northern demand for international environmental public goods not adequately produced by states in the South. In this context, southern environmental NGOs not only attract needed resources (e.g., foreign exchange, new technology) that might not otherwise head South, but also develop innovative institutional mechanisms to facilitate this transfer (e.g., debt-for-development swaps, biodiversity contracts). Illustrative cases from Costa Rica (INBio) and Ecuador (Fundación Natura).

Pearce, Jenny. 1997. “Between co-optation and irrelevance? Latin American NGOs in the 1990s.” In David Hulme and Michael Edwards, eds. *NGOs, states and donors: Too close for comfort?* New York, NY: St. Martin’s Press, pp. 257-74.

Schematically describes the evolution of Latin America’s “associational culture” since the 1960s and the changing relationship of NGOs to nation states and donors in this context. Argues that in the 1980s, NGOs were made part of a political project openly advocated by international financial institutions and bilateral donors that aims at free-market, capitalist modernization and liberal democratization. In the 1990s, Latin American NGOs face the imperative of critically reassessing their complicity in this project by reflecting on sources of legitimacy and accountability to beneficiaries.

Reilly, Charles A., ed. 1995. *New paths to democratic development in Latin America: The rise of NGO-municipal collaboration*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.

Compilation of articles by NGO practitioners describing NGO-municipal government joint ventures for the provision of key social services in urban Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico and Peru. As centralized corporatist states face heightened fiscal constraints and pressure for democratization, the burden of social service provision is shifted to local and municipal governments. Difficulties providing these services are exacerbated by continued rural-urban migration. Cases analyze collaboration in the health care, waste management, housing and urban mass transit sectors. Volume includes country-specific bibliography. Research sponsored by the Inter-American Foundation.

Uphoff, Norman. 1993. “Grassroots organizations and NGOs in rural development: Opportunities with diminishing States and expanding markets.” *World Development* 21(4): 607-22.

Clearly written, theoretically rich article exploring relationship between public, private, and collective action sectors. Highly recommended as introductory material for a course examining conceptual and empirical interdependence of the state, market and NGOs in the contemporary Third World.

## **II. NGOs and the World Bank: Environmental Advocacy**

Fox, Jonathan A. and L. David Brown, eds. 1998. *The Struggle for accountability: The World Bank, NGOs and grassroots movements*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Unlike previous treatments of NGO-inspired World Bank reform, focuses on both impact of advocacy campaigns and accountability of these campaigns to grassroots actors. Provides case studies (two from Latin America) of advocacy centered on specific Bank projects and case studies

of advocacy centered on Bank policy domains (e.g., indigenous rights, resettlement and water resources management).

George, Susan and Fabrizio Sabelli. 1994. *Faith and credit: The World Bank's secular empire*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Draws an analogy between the medieval Church and the World Bank in order to explain the latter's capacity to grow in size and influence for the past half century despite clear evidence generated by the Bank itself that it has failed in its "mission." Clever think-piece but touches only indirectly on the issue of NGO-multilateral development banks cooperation and conflict.

Heredia, Carlos and Mary Purcell. 1994. *The polarization of Mexican society: A grassroots view of World Bank economic adjustment programs*. Washington, DC: The Development Gap and Equipo Pueblo.

Report requested by NGO Working Group on the World Bank (the Bank-sanctioned forum for voicing NGO concerns about Bank policy). Example of collaboration between Southern and Northern NGOs to issue critique of the effects of structural adjustment on income distribution and the environment. Case studies of rural producers in Chihuahua and urban consumers in a low-income Mexico City neighborhood.

Nelson, Paul. 1996. "Internationalising economic and environmental policy: Transnational NGO networks and the World Bank's expanding influence." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 25(3): 605-33.

Highlights significant unintended consequence of NGO advocacy *vis-à-vis* the World Bank on the issues of environment, poverty and structural adjustment: increased Bank leverage (and decreased national control) over domestic policies in developing countries.

Nelson, Paul. 1995. *The World Bank and Non-Governmental Organizations: The limits of apolitical development*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press.

Excellent, balanced analysis of NGO-World Bank relations since 1970s. Draws on Bank-reported data on 304 projects involving NGOs as well as interviews and case studies to suggest that the "quantity" of Bank-financed projects involving NGO participation has increased over time, but the "quality" of NGOs roles is limited. Identifies troubling tendency of the Bank to employ NGOs to ease the impact and absorb the political backlash of structural adjustment. Maintaining the myth that the Bank promotes an "apolitical" development agenda is integral to this adaptive strategy.

Paul, Samuel and Arturo Israel, eds. 1991. *Nongovernmental Organizations and the World Bank: Cooperation for development*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

World Bank assessment of strengths and weaknesses of NGO involvement in Bank-sponsored development projects. Conclusions about limits to this involvement surprisingly similar to those of NGO-sympathetic literature, but strikingly more positive spin on Bank actions to facilitate this participation. For didactic purposes, nice counter-interpretation of trends and data analyzed by Nelson (1995).

Rich, Bruce M. 1994. *Mortgaging the Earth: The World Bank, environmental impoverishment, and the crisis of development*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

Frequently cited "history" of the World Bank's 50-year trajectory from the environmental activist perspective. Informed by author's direct involvement in the multilateral development

banks' campaign as an advocate for a Washington-based NGO. Provides illustrative eyewitness account of NGO-Bank exchanges (via correspondence, meetings, etc.) but straddles the boundary between the scholarly and the purely polemic. Argues that the key to environmental protection is respect for local knowledge embodied in decentralized networks of actors rather than "global technocracy" where power is concentrated in a small group of bureaucrats. Cites several examples of local-global initiatives and experiments in foreign aid that bypass nation-states and multilateral organizations, including Brazilian rubber tappers movement and the Climate Alliance of European Cities with Indigenous People of the Rainforest.

Rich, Bruce M. 1990. "The emperor's new clothes: The World Bank and environmental reform." *World Policy Journal* Spring: 305-29.

Highly critical assessment of reforms announced by World Bank President Barber Conable in 1987 in response to NGO "MDB (multilateral development bank) campaign." These "new clothes"—alleged increases in World Bank environmental staff, a novel Tropical Forestry Action Plan (TFAP), publication of environmental issues paper series, etc.—"bear only faint traces of green." Rather than effectively addressing problems of forced resettlement and tropical deforestation on the ground, these actions amount to a proliferation of green rhetoric that conceals the reality of continued environmental degradation underwritten by MDBs. The TFAP, for instance, facilitates Bank lending for export-oriented timber enterprises under the rubric of "sustainable forestry." Contradictory pressures from member governments and lack of accountability to donors and borrowers alike contribute to the Bank's inability to affect true environmental reform.

Rich, Bruce M. 1985. "The Multilateral Development Banks, environmental policy and the United States." *Ecology Law Quarterly* 12(4): 681-745.

Traces actions by the US Congress and Executive Branch to regulate the impact of foreign aid on the environment. These efforts concentrated on US Agency for International Development (AID) in the late 1970s and on multilateral institutions in the early 1980s. MDBs have only slowly and incrementally addressed environmental issues, but these changes, albeit limited, are largely due to outside pressure from the United States.

Schwartzman, Stephan. 1986. *Bankrolling disaster: International development banks and the global environment*. San Francisco, CA: Sierra Club Books.

A citizen's guide to making multilateral development bank (MDB) policies sensitive to environmentally sustainable development and the integrity of indigenous peoples. Profiles four World Bank-financed "development debacles," including Brazil's Polonoroeste project that entailed highway construction facilitating peasant colonization into tropical rainforests. This booklet outlines the nuts-and-bolts of bank project cycles, reprints primary texts that document recent bank reforms, and suggests concrete strategies for citizen involvement. Appropriate didactic material for undergraduate audiences unfamiliar with the workings of MDBs.

### III. Insights from International Relations Theory: Global Civil Society/World Politics

Conca, Ken. 1994. "Rethinking the ecology-sovereignty debate." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 23(3): 701-11.

Insightful, timely response to frequent but insufficiently critical claims that international pressure for environmental protection undermines or enhances state sovereignty. Asserts need for a multi-dimensional concept of state sovereignty and a more careful, differentiated analysis of international environmental pressure. Illustrates complexity of issue with example from Brazilian Amazon.

Kamieniecki, Sheldon, ed. 1993. *Environmental politics in the international arena: Movements, parties, organizations, and policy*. New York, NY: State University of New York Press.

Collection of essays on environmental politics by prominent scholars in comparative politics and international relations. Comprised of sections focusing on major actors (environmental movements, green parties, and international organizations) as well as section exploring environmental politics in Western Europe, Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union, Latin America, and Asia, respectively. Chapter by Bron Taylor et al. (Section II) compares instances of environmental resistance in India and Sri Lanka, the Pacific Rim, Southeast Asia, Africa and South America.

Lipschutz, Ronnie E. 1992. "Reconstructing world politics: The emergence of global civil society." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 21(3): 389-420.

Ground-breaking think-piece that explores the rise of "global civil society" as a response to three historical factors: 1) the rise of liberal norms that posit individual rights above the rights of nation-states; 2) the decreasing willingness and ability of states to carry out basic welfare functions; and, 3) the emergence of new forms of identity (e.g., gender) that undermine old forms linked with the nation-state. Rather abstract, but a "must-read" for intelligent upper-class students interested in a political science perspective on globalization. This article forms part of a *Millennium* special issue on "global civil society."

Lipschutz, Ronnie D. and Ken Conca, eds. 1993. *The state and social power in global environmental politics*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

Impressive collection of essays that addresses "paucity of cross-fertilization between international relations and other disciplines concerned with issues relevant to global environmental change." Editors invoke dramaturgical metaphor to describe state and non-state actors involved in sociopolitical struggles that impinge on and respond to global environmental change. A veritable source-book on "new actors in environment" in the global context.

MacDonald, Laura. 1994. "Globalising civil society: Interpreting international NGOs in Central America." *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 23(2): 267-85.

Critiques standard international relations conceptions of "global civil society" for ignoring sources of inequality and forms of contestation that take place within this sphere. Applies "critical theory" (e.g., Gramsci) to interpret case of NGO involvement in "the Central American crisis" in the 1980s. Points out polarization of NGOs (both Northern and Southern) into progressive and conservative camps that reflected a broader international power struggle in the region.

Princen, Thomas and Matthias Finger, eds. 1994. *Environmental NGOs in world politics: Linking the local and the global*. London, UK & New York, NY: Routledge.

Attempt to conceptualize the "NGO phenomenon" in the context of the global environmental crisis. Focus on the ability of NGOs to transcend national boundaries and thus link local and global agendas and actors in ways that state and multinational financial institutions cannot. Includes detailed case histories of the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement, the ivory trade ban, the Antarctic Environmental Protocol and the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development process.

Risse-Kappen, Thomas. 1994. "Ideas do not float freely: Transnational coalitions, domestic structures and the end of the Cold War." *International Organization* 48(2): 185-214.

Represents trend in international relations scholarship to analyze how “transnationally transmitted ideas” affect foreign policy shifts. Specifically, looks at the role that links between intellectuals, policy analysts and center-left political parties in the US, Europe and the former Soviet Union played in bringing the Cold War to an end.

Shaw, Martin. 1994. “Civil society and global politics: Beyond a social movements approach.” *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 23(3): 647-67.

Argues that, by and large, social movements remain responses to national phenomena and highlights obstacles to their efficacy at the international level. Conceptually, asserts the superiority of a “civil society approach” to understanding global politics over a “social movements approach.” This article exemplifies the tendency of disciplinary loyalists to split hairs over terminology. Recommended for course that focuses on cross-disciplinary debates about the nature of global civil society, but otherwise not compelling as didactic material.

Sikkink, Kathryn. 1993. “Human rights, principled issue-networks, and sovereignty in Latin America.” *International Organization* 47(3): 411-41.

Documents how human rights advocacy spearheaded by international NGOs impels states to reconstitute notion of sovereignty. This modified concept allows for the intervention of international actors to protect citizens from abuses perpetrated by national governments. Illustrates argument by examining human rights policy and practices in Argentina and Mexico in the 1970s and 1980s.

Wapner, Paul. 1996. *Environmental activism and world civic politics*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Critique of statist, supra-statist and sub-statist frameworks for analyzing global environmental problems. Case studies of Greenpeace, World Wildlife Fund and Friends of the Earth illustrate alternative strategies: non-state political practices at the global, local and international levels, respectively. Conceptually, this piece speaks primarily to international relations literature.

## **VI. Insights from Social Movement And Resistance Theory: Transnational Actors and Identities**

Alvarez, Sonia E.; Dagnino, Evelina; and Escobar, Arturo, eds. 1998. *Cultures of politics/politics of cultures: Revisioning Latin American social movements*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Ambitious attempt to reconceptualize cultural and political aspects of contemporary social movements in Latin America. Essays probe concepts of networks, civil society and democratization in the context of these movements through case studies from Brazil, Chile, Mexico, Guatemala and Colombia. Cutting edge, synthetic complement to standard social movement literature. Includes contribution by renowned social movement theorist Alberto Melucci.

Alvarez, Sonia E. and Arturo Escobar, eds. 1992. *The making of social movements in Latin America: Identity, strategy and democracy*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

A watershed in the analysis of Latin American social movements. Synthesizes and propels forward theoretical debates that—until the publication of this edited volume—largely eschewed dialogue across disciplinary, social movement paradigm, and continental boundaries. Structuring themes of “identity” and “strategy” echo classic categorization of social movement perspectives

first articulated by Cohen (1985). Excellent starting point for coursework that explores the “mosaic” of ostensibly novel forms of collective action emerging in Latin America in the 1990s.

Brown, Michael F. 1993. “Facing the state, facing the world: Amazonia’s native leaders and the new politics of identity.” *L’homme* 126-8 (April-December), 33(2-4): 307-26.

Reflects on effects that the 500-year “conversation” between Amazonian Indians and the West has had on internal dynamics of Amazonian leadership. Conjectures that contact with nation-states has shaped Indian forms of organization and the very conceptual categories by which Indians perceive themselves collectively (e.g., the notion of “tribe”). Stimulating and delightfully written essay that touches on recurrent themes in literature on internationalized Amazonian activism from an anthropological perspective.

Brysk, Alison. 1996. “Turning weakness into strength: The internationalization of Indian rights.” *Latin American Perspectives* 23(2): 38-57.

Study of international Indian rights movement based on interviews with advocates and attendance at the UN Working Group meetings in Geneva in 1993. Argues that through creative use of images and information, South American Indians have turned their greatest liability—domestic marginality and poverty—into their greatest strength in the international arena. Clear exposition of movement’s evolution and panoply of actors involved that speaks directly to debates among social movement theorists. Representative of political scientific and sociological perspectives on the emergence of “internationalized,” identity-based movements in the South.

Carr, Barry. 1996. “Crossing borders: Labor internationalism in the era of NAFTA.” In Gerardo Otero, ed. *Neoliberalism revisited: Economic restructuring and Mexico’s political future*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, pp. 209-31.

Overview of historical precedents and current state of labor internationalism in Mexico. What’s new about labor internationalism in the NAFTA era? Leftist “grand narratives” (i.e., ideology) have lost power to unite workers across borders in post-Cold War world, but current focus on free trade has expanded debate (and potential bases of solidarity) to include issues of democracy, human rights, and environmental protection.

Chalmers, Douglas A.; Vilas, Carlos M.; Hite, Katherine; Martin, Scott B.; Piester, Kerianne; and Segarra, Monique, eds. 1997. *The new politics of inequality in Latin America: Rethinking participation and representation*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Cutting edge collection of essays scrutinizing the decline of traditional modes of political representation and popular organization in Latin America and describing the emergence of “more variegated and less centralized structures of representation” that editors deem “associational networks.” Case studies from Southern Cone, Ecuador, Colombia, Nicaragua, Guatemala and Mexico.

Chatterjee, Pratap and Matthias Finger. 1994. *The Earth brokers: Power, politics and world development*. London, UK & New York, NY: Routledge.

Radically critical overview of the preparatory meetings, official proceedings, and outcomes of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) process. Includes discourse analysis of documents produced as well as discussions of the state and non-state actors involved.

Cohen, Jean L. 1985. “Strategy or identity: New theoretical paradigms and contemporary social movements.” *Social Research* 52(4): 663-716.



Groundbreaking essay that juxtaposes two major social movement paradigms by asking “what’s new” about contemporary social movements according to each perspective. Lays foundation for later attempts at synthesizing these approaches by identifying points of convergence between them. Forms part of much-referenced *Social Research* issue devoted to social movement analysis. More than a decade after its publication, Cohen’s contribution serves as useful (and frequently cited) guide to debates about “old” and “new” social movements among proponents of “resource mobilization” and “identity-oriented” paradigms.

Cook, María Elena. 1997. “Regional integration and transnational politics: Popular sector strategies in the NAFTA era.” In Douglas A. Chalmers et al., eds. *The new politics of inequality in Latin America: Rethinking participation and representation*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, pp. 516-40.

Argues that “formal recognition of regional trade integration in North America has produced a ‘transnational political arena’ that has expanded the resources available to non-governmental groups, increased their leverage in domestic political arenas, and broadened their strategic options.” Reviews concrete strategies employed by networks of labor activists before and since the passage of NAFTA. Speaks to strengths and weaknesses of both international relations and social movement literature without becoming mired in details of particular theories or polemics. Very nice combination of empirical and theoretical analysis. Easily accessible to (and highly recommended for) undergraduate audiences.

Escobar, Arturo. 1995. *Encountering development: The making and unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Provocative critique of concepts and practices of “development” wielded by the West *vis-à-vis* the so-called Third World. Uses discourse analysis to expose how these reduce social relations and human experience to economic categories proffered by neoliberal capitalism. Provides case study of the problematization of malnutrition and hunger, and the “solutions” to these conjured up by Western academics, the UN and multi-lateral financial institutions: nutrition, health and rural development programs. Also focuses on World Bank practices that construct the client categories of “peasants,” “women” and “the environment.” Nearly impenetrable and often repetitive writing style likely to frustrate even the most perceptive and diligent undergraduate reader.

Gabriel, Christina and Laura Macdonald. 1994. “NAFTA, women and organising in Canada and Mexico: Forging a ‘feminist internationality.’” *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 23(3): 535-62.

Observes that efforts to unite women in Canada, the US and Mexico in response to NAFTA suffer from the false assumption that North American trade affects these women in similar ways. Attributes success of Canadian women’s organizations in building cross-border solidarity to the strong voice that women of color have gained in the Canadian feminist movement. Advocates the need to recognize differences both within and between groups of women in these countries.

Hellman, Judith Adler. 1997. “Social movements: Revolution, reform and reaction.” *NACLA Report on the Americas* 30(6): 13-8.

Brief retrospective outlining how leftist intellectuals’ and activists’ views about “social movements” have evolved over the past 30 years. Essay commissioned as part of *NACLA* 30-year anniversary celebration.

Kearney, Michael and Stefano Varese. 1995. "Latin America's indigenous peoples: Changing identities and forms of resistance." In Sandor Halebsky and Richard L. Harris, eds. *Capital, power and inequality in Latin America*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, pp. 207-31.

Basic, historically-attentive overview of dialectic between imperialist incursions and identity-formation among Latin American *indígenas*. Delineates historically recurring, "fundamental forms of ethnic resilience and opposition" employed by *indígenas* that include "moral management of the cosmos," adherence to a "moral economy," and concealment of ethnobiological knowledge. Loosely structured essay offering few theoretically novel insights, but replete with references to broader literatures and interesting empirical examples.

Keck, Margaret E. and Kathryn Sikkink. 1997. *Activists beyond borders: Advocacy networks in international politics*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Theoretically self-conscious, methodologically rigorous and conceptually innovative examination of the origins, strategies and impact of transnational "advocacy networks" that have crystallized around human rights in Latin America, the environment and violence against women. Authors emphasize agency involved in global social change (as opposed to theorists of "global civil society" or "world politics" who explain globalization as the function of diffusion and stress its inevitability).

Maiguashca, Bice. 1994. "The transnational indigenous movement in a changing world order." In Sakamoto Yoshkazu, ed. *Global transformation: Challenges to the State system*. Tokyo, New York & Paris: United Nations University Press.

Attributes the rise of the transnational indigenous movement—institutionally embodied in the World Council of Indigenous Peoples and the UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations—to the increasing threat of territorial displacement linked to global capitalist expansion, assimilationist policies advanced by nation-states, and openings for organization spurred by international laws concerning indigenous populations. Argues that the movement has appropriated Western concepts of "development," "non-discrimination" and "self-determination" to counter dominant Western world order.

McCarthy, John D. and Mayer N. Zald. 1977. "Resource mobilization in social movements: A partial theory." *American Journal of Sociology* 82: 1212-41.

Early and oft-cited outline of what has come to be known as the "resource mobilization" approach to social movements. This approach emphasizes organizational capacity and ability to procure support from "conscience constituents" (supporters who do not stand to gain directly by involvement in a given movement) as key to success. Counters claims that grievances are sufficient cause of social movement activity. Article is staple for study of social movements. Also recommended for theoretically-oriented course on actors in environment and development.

Melucci, Alberto. 1989. *Nomads of the present: Social movements and individual needs in contemporary society*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Represents European "new social movements" school of thought. Identifies novel features of contemporary social movements as the centrality of "information resources" (the production and circulation of "signs" as opposed to material goods), emphasis on forms of collective action as ends in-and-of themselves (rather than as merely means to an end); and the "planetarization" of these movements. The latter entails individuals' growing self-perception as members of human species and preoccupation with the continued survival of species in context of extreme interdependence. This perspective is helpful in understanding rise of social movements attentive to environmental degradation.

Peet, Richard and Michael Watts, eds. 1996. *Liberation ecologies: Environment, development and social movements*. London, UK & New York, NY: Routledge.

Like Escobar (1995), this book seeks critical evaluation of the categories of “environment” and “development,” and the relationship between the two. Essays illustrate how societies carry an “environmental imaginary” that lies at the heart of social movements and challenge hegemonic conceptions of nature-society relations. Editors coin concept of “liberation ecologies” to denote the approach to analyzing this nature-society nexus that both critiques Western notions of environment and development, and “critically appreciates” alternative rationalities. Innovative, but exceedingly abstract.

Phillips, Lynne, ed. 1998. *The third wave of modernization in Latin America: Cultural perspectives on neoliberalism*. Jaguar Books on Latin America, No. 16. Wilmington, DE: Scholarly Resources, Inc.

A kaleidoscopic view of neoliberalisms in Latin America cobbled together from anthropological case studies from Mexico, Bolivia, Guatemala, Peru, Nicaragua, Argentina and Brazil. Intellectual agenda of this volume—“to integrate specificities into the debates about the changes taking place in Latin America today” and to resist the notion of one monolithic “neoliberalism” that affects Latin Americans equally everywhere.” Cogent and long overdue given frequent and often uncritical use of the term “neoliberalism.” Individual chapters, however, of uneven analytical rigor.

Smith, Jackie; Chatfield, Charles; and Pagnucco, Ron, eds. 1997. *Transnational social movements and global politics: Solidarity beyond the State*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.

Collection of essays applying resource mobilization model of social movements to understand emergence of transnational actors targeting nation states and international institutions. Includes hefty theoretical component as well as nine case studies of transnational social movement organizations working on issues ranging from “peace and justice” in Latin America to international cooperation for ocean resource management. Of special interest for “new actors in environment and development” is Smith chapter documenting one transnational movement organization’s efforts to pressure governments to implement United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) agreements.

Smith, Jackie. 1995. “Transnational political processes and the Human Rights movement.” *Research in Social Movements, Conflict and Change* 18: 185-219.

Expands “political opportunities” model (c.f. Tarrow, 1994) to explain increasingly transnational nature of contemporary social movements. Posits the end of the Cold War, the build-up of UN institutions, and legislation granting NGOs consultative status within these institutions as key elements in the rise of this global political context. Focuses on coordination between local and global actors to pressure nation states. Top-down analysis that describes human rights movement in terms of international institutions and organizations to the exclusion of grassroots actors.

Tarrow, Sidney. 1994. *Power in movement: Social movements, collective action and politics*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Well-written summary of the political process or “political opportunities structure” approach to social movement analysis. Synthesizes more than a decade of research exploring the relationship between shifts in political power and social movement activity. Reflects on prospects of an increasingly violent, transnational “movement society.” A classic in social movement literature. Appropriate for theory-driven course on changing forms of social action in modern world.

## V. Illustrative Case Studies (primarily but not exclusively from Mexico and Brazil)

Bray, David Barton. 1991. "The struggle for the forest: Conservation and development in the Sierra Juárez." *Grassroots Development* 15(3): 12-25.

Blow-by-blow account of advances and setbacks experienced by one set of local forestry organizations in the state of Oaxaca, Mexico. Describes external obstacles to sustainable, community-managed forestry initiatives, but also highlights "sawmill vs. extractive reserve" dilemma facing and sometimes dividing local communities. Text-box provides useful overview of community forestry in Mexico at large. This article forms part of *Grassroots Development* (Inter-American Foundation journal) special issue on community forestry and the environment. See also Stanley (1991).

Carr, Barry. 1997 (forthcoming). "'From the mountains of the southeast:' A review of recent writings on the Zapatistas of Chiapas." *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies* 3(2).

Notes dearth of studies that explore Chiapas insurrection in the context of "the rebirth of civil society" in Mexico. Asserts that the growth of citizens rights NGOs (e.g., the Civic Alliance/*Alianza Cívica*), the rise of a significant center-left opposition party, and "new forms of cross-border cooperation between workers and unions" are phenomena that must be taken into account in order to understand this movement. This review essay lacks a sustained argument, but provides provocative commentary and a useful orientation to the burgeoning literature on Chiapas.

Cohn, Amélia. 1995. "NGOs, social movements, and the privatization of health care: Experiences in São Paulo." In Charles A. Reilly, ed. *New paths to democratic development in Latin America: The rise of NGO-municipal collaboration*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., pp. 85-98.

A commentary on the capacity of Brazilian NGOs and social movements to pressure the state for health care services for the poor. Describes efforts to establish municipal health councils with local participation in two peri-urban settlements of São Paulo. Focus on NGO/social movement involvement in urban health care complements literature heavily skewed towards analysis of NGOs working in agricultural development.

Collier, George A. 1994. *Basta! Land and the Zapatista rebellion in Chiapas*. Oakland, CA: The Institute for Food and Development Policy.

Empirically grounded and academically informed account of the root causes of the Chiapas conflict. Ascribes the rebellion largely to state policies that ended land reform through legal channels, initiated colonization schemes and the creation of bioreserves that heightened pressure for land in the Lacandon jungle, and promoted energy-led industrial growth models that turned the terms of trade against peasant producers. Illustrates how neoliberal reform in Mexico has served as crucible for the emergence of new actors such as the Zapatistas.

Conklin, Beth A. and Laura R. Graham. 1995. "The shifting middle ground: Amazonian Indians and eco-politics." *American Anthropologist* 97(4): 695-710.

Insightful analysis of the impacts—both positive and negative—that the internationalization of local Amazonian struggles have had on the political potential of South American Indians. Contrasts the trajectories of two Brazilian indigenous leaders to demonstrate how the rise of environmentalism in the mid-1980s generated unprecedented opportunities for alliances between Indians framing claims to self-determination in terms of environmentalism and environmentalists packaging conservation campaigns in terms of "human rights." Points out three areas of concern

as well: the margin of disjuncture between goals of conservation and self-determination, the reliance on a small number of culture brokers to mediate relationships between local indigenous peoples and international supporters, and nationalist backlash to local attempts to forge links with global partners. Recommended for classroom instruction at graduate and undergraduate levels.

Cowell, Adrian. 1990. *The decade of destruction: The crusade to save the Amazon rainforests*. New York, NY: Henry Holt and Company.

A documentary filmmaker's attempt to record in writing what he calls "the greatest holocaust that man has ever known as year by year the earth's largest mass of vegetation turns itself into the greatest cloud of smoke the atmosphere has ever received." Based on observations gathered over the course of 30 years of film expeditions in the Amazon. Notes that despite disastrous environmental destruction since the 1960s, grassroots pressure groups like the rubber tappers represent potential solutions. Anecdotal but informative.

Gedicks, Al. 1993. *The new resource wars: Native and environmental struggles against multinational corporations*. Boston, MA: South End Press.

Documents instances of a growing "native-environmentalist" alliance against multinational corporations' attempts at resource extraction. Focuses primarily on resistance from Native Americans against mining megaprojects in northern Wisconsin, but Chapter 1 develops interesting comparison of indigenous opposition to hydroelectric dams in Quebec, logging enterprises in Malaysia and oil drilling in Ecuador.

Hall, Anthony. 1994. "Grassroots action for resettlement planning: Brazil and beyond." *World Development* 22(12): 1793-1809.

Comparison of three local protest movements to hydroelectric power projects in diverse regions financed by the Brazilian government and multi-lateral institutions. Oriented toward policymakers and development planners who have tended to ignore the interests and mobilizing potential of populations adversely affected by these projects.

Kane, Joe. 1995. *Savages*. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf.

A rainy weekend's worth of poignant pleasure reading that details the seemingly insurmountable obstacles facing the Huaorani peoples (Ecuador) as they struggle for control of their land against the interests of transnational oil companies and their national allies, and the misguided efforts of missionaries and environmentalists. A journalistic account from the point of view of one former environmental activist who lived and worked with the Huaorani for an extended period of time. Shorter pieces by the same author (especially Kane, 1993) capture the essence of Huaorani predicament in a more pointed manner.

Kane, Joe. 1994. "Moi goes to Washington." *The New Yorker* May: 172-81.

Profiles the journey that one Huaorani leader makes from the rainforest to the halls of the Organization of American States and Ecuadorian Embassy in Washington, D.C. to speak on behalf of his tribe against the indiscriminate environmental destruction wreaked by oil exploration in the Amazon.

Kane, Joe. 1993. "With spears from all sides." *The New Yorker* September: 54-79.

Excellent, easily readable and extremely witty account of oil development in the Ecuadorian "Oriente" and one tribe's fight against "the Company." Problematizes issue of accountability and "voice" that emerges as myriad national and international environmental NGOs, academics,

politicians and religious proselytizers endeavor to “defend” Ecuadorian indigenous people against this threat. Author also points out splits between distinct indigenous groups that inhabit the Ecuadorian Amazon (e.g., Quechua, Shuar and Huaorani) that are often overlooked by outsiders who champion “their” right to the land. Highly recommended as a nuanced introduction to complexity of Amazonian environmental activism and actors.

Keck, Margaret E. 1995. “Social equity and environmental politics in Brazil: Lessons from the rubber tappers of Acre.” *Comparative Politics* July: 409-24.

Employs constructivist social movement theory (Snow et al.) to explain the international “symbolic reverberations” of rubber tappers movement in western Brazil. Argues that this movement served as metaphor for the unity of environment and development, of stewardship of natural resources and human rights. Parallels anthropological arguments put forth by Conklin and Graham (1995). Very clear, concise summary of the rubber tappers movement and creative application of theory to interesting empirical case.

Lorentzen, Lois Ann. 1995. “Bread and soil of our dreams: Women, the environment, and sustainable development: Case studies from Central America.” In Bron Raymond Taylor, ed. 1995. *Ecological resistance movements: The global emergence of radical and popular environmentalism*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, pp. 56-69.

Rather spotty commentary on Central American “ecofeminism.” Highlights relationship between women’s roles as caretakers (e.g., providers of food, fuel and water) and increasing awareness of how environmental degradation threatens their families’ livelihood. Draws “lessons learned from the Central American reality” based on anecdotal references to activism in El Salvador and Honduras.

Moguel, Julio. 1995. “Local power and development alternatives: An urban popular movement in northern Mexico.” In Charles A. Reilly, ed. *New paths to democratic development in Latin America: The rise of NGO-municipal collaboration*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc, pp. 211-28.

Case study of the Francisco Villa Committee for Popular Defense of Durango. Illustrates complex and dynamic relationship among grassroots social movement organizations, government and political parties in contemporary Mexico.

Revkin, Andrew. 1990. *The burning season: The murder of Chico Mendes and the fight for the Amazon rain forest*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Chronicles the trajectory of environmental activism in the Brazilian Amazon through the lens of the life and death of rubber workers organizer and activist, Chico Mendes. One of several books of uneven quality produced in the wake of the 1988 Mendes assassination. Sensationalized, melodramatic account of admittedly tragic events.

Schwartzman, Stephan. 1991. “Deforestation and popular resistance in Acre: From local social movements to global network.” *Centennial Review* 35(2): 397-422.

Case history of Brazilian rubber tappers that highlights the international alliances this movement constructed with multilateral development banks as they became “new and powerful actors in the Amazon.” Provides statistical overview of land distribution and urban-rural demographics as background for understanding the predicament of rubber tappers in Acre. Also explains logic behind their proposal to create “extractive reserves” as a vehicle for promoting the sustainable use of the Amazonian rainforest.

Silva, Eduardo. 1994. "Thinking politically about sustainable development in the tropical forests of Latin America." *Development and Change* 25: 697-721.

Explores factors that "impel or compel" Latin American governments to implement policies designed to halt environmental degradation. Employs political economy approach that highlights conflicts and coalitions between state elites, dominant classes, local subordinate groups and international allies. Illustrates arguments with case studies of Brazilian extractive reserves and community forestry initiatives in Mexico and Peru.

Stanley, Denise. 1991. "Demystifying the tragedy of the commons: The resin tappers of Honduras." *Grassroots Development* 15(3): 26-33.

Refutes critiques of common property regimes that assume the latter allows open access to resources and thus leads to the "tragedy of the commons." Draws on examples from Honduran resin tapper organizations to illustrate argument and identify factors (besides property regimes) that facilitate sustainable forestry initiatives. This article forms part of *Grassroots Development* (Inter-American Foundation journal) special issue on community forestry and the environment. See also Bray, 1991.

Turner, Terence. 1995. "The Kayapó revolt against extractivism: An indigenous people's struggle for socially equitable and ecologically sustainable production." Paper presented for conference on *Sustainable Development in Rural Latin America: Human and Environmental Consequences*. Center for Latin American Studies, University of Chicago.

Documents how the forms of political organization and social stratification among the Kayapó people (Brazil) are reconfigured in the context of resisting and accommodating gold mining and logging in the region. Rich ethnographic account. For a copy of this paper, contact the Center for Latin American Studies at the University of Chicago.

Williams, Heather L. 1996. "Planting trouble: The Barzón's debtors movement in Mexico." *Current Issues Brief Series* No. 6. San Diego, CA: Center for US-Mexican Studies, University of California.

Concise and extremely informative study of multi-class protest movement triggered by 1994 peso crisis but evolving into "the clearinghouse for political objections to the neoliberal economic regime" in Mexico. Includes series of political cartoons reprinted from Mexican press expressing scathing popular critique of collusion between Mexican state and international financial establishment. Highly recommended as illustration of broad-based, peaceful challenge to neoliberal reform that has been understudied to date.

